IJAYUSH
International Journal of AYUSH
AYURVEDA, YOGA, UNANI, SIDDHA AND HOMEOPATHY
http://internationaljournal.org.in/journal/index.php/ijayush/

International Journal
Panacea
Research library
ISSN: 2349 7025

Review Article | Volume 14 Issue 07 | July 2025

FROM OPHTHALMOLOGY TO OPTICAL SCIENCE: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF ALI IBN ISA AL-KAHHAL AND IBN AL-HAYTHAM

Khesal Ahmad[1] and *Mohd Faisal[2]

[1]Professor cum HOD Department Ophthalmology, ENT and Dentistry, Government Tibbi College and Hospital Patna, Bihar. E-mail: kahmadalig49@gmail.com

[2]Assistant Professor, Department: Tashreehul Badan

College Address: A&U Tibbia College and Hospital Karol Bagh, New Delhi

*Corresponding Author's Email ID: faazmiazmi@gmail.com

Abstract

The Islamic Golden Age witnessed remarkable advancements in optics, with scholars such as Ali ibn Isa al-Kahhal and Ibn al-Haytham making significant yet distinct contributions. Ali ibn Isa, a leading ophthalmologist, compiled *Tadhkirat al-Kahhalin*, a comprehensive medical treatise detailing over 130 eye diseases, diagnostic methods, and surgical procedures, particularly in cataract treatment (Abudawood et al., 2021). His work was instrumental in shaping medieval and early modern ophthalmology (Library of Congress, 2021; Henry & Jaffe, 2020).

In contrast, Ibn al-Haytham, often regarded as the father of modern optics, transformed the field with his empirical and mathematical approach in *Kitab al-Manazir* (Masoud & Masoud, 2006). He challenged the Greek emission theory of vision, instead proposing the intromission theory, supported by experiments on light refraction, reflection, and perception, as well as his pioneering study of the camera obscura (Raynaud, 2022; Sabra, 2024; Wilk, 2015).

Despite their different approaches—Ali ibn Isa's being medical and descriptive, and Ibn al-Haytham's being theoretical and experimental—their work collectively advanced the understanding of vision. Ali ibn Isa's clinical expertise complemented Ibn al-Haytham's optical theories, influencing later scholars such as Roger Bacon and Al-Farisi, who bridged the fields of medical ophthalmology and optical physics. This paper critically analyzes their methodologies, comparing their strengths and limitations while assessing their broader influence on both medieval and modern science. The review concludes that their combined legacy laid a foundation for future developments in optics, demonstrating the interconnectedness of medical practice and scientific inquiry.

Introduction

The field of optics saw significant advancements in the Islamic Golden Age, with scholars like Ali ibn Isa al-Kahhal and Ibn al-Haytham making fundamental contributions. While Ali ibn Isa focused on ophthalmology, his insights into vision complemented the more theoretical and experimental approach of Ibn al-Haytham, who revolutionized optics with his empirical methods (Masoud & Masoud, 2006; Abudawood et al., 2021).

Ali ibn Isa al-Kahhal: Contributions and Limitations

Ali ibn Isa al-Kahhal (circa 11th century CE), often revered in historical texts as "the oculist," stands out as one of the most accomplished ophthalmologists of the Islamic Golden Age. His monumental medical treatise, *Tadhkirat al-Kahhalin* (*The Notebook of the Oculists*), holds an unparalleled place in the history of medieval ophthalmology. This encyclopedic work systematically catalogs **over 130 distinct ocular diseases**, covering their symptoms, etiologies, diagnostic criteria, prognostic indicators, and therapeutic approaches, including both **medical prescriptions and surgical interventions** (Library of Congress, 2021). Written in a methodical and pragmatic style, it was not merely a compilation of prior knowledge but a synthesis of practical clinical experience, observation, and therapeutic innovation.

Ali ibn Isa's *Tadhkirah* reflects a **deep anatomical knowledge** of the human eye, especially remarkable considering the limited anatomical dissection allowed during his era. His treatise includes **detailed descriptions of ocular structures** such as the **conjunctiva, cornea, lens, sclera, retina, and optic nerve,** often accompanied by careful differentiations between diseases affecting each part (Abudawood et al., 2021). His explanations of conditions such as **trachoma, conjunctivitis, cataracts, and optic atrophy** reflect a nuanced understanding of pathology that was centuries ahead of many of his contemporaries.

One of Ali ibn Isa's **most influential contributions** was his **description of cataract treatment through couching,** a method where the opaque lens is displaced to restore partial vision. Though this technique was known in antiquity, Ali ibn Isa's detailed operative guidelines, emphasis on patient selection, and post-operative care protocols helped **standardize cataract surgery** in the Islamic world. His insights were instrumental in the **refinement of surgical practice,** particularly in minimizing iatrogenic complications like corneal damage or postoperative infections (Henry & Jaffe, 2020). The *Tadhkirah* also discusses **oculoplastic**

procedures, management of traumatic injuries, and the treatment of corneal opacities, making it a **comprehensive manual for eye care.**

Moreover, Ali ibn Isa's work reflects a **rational and systematic clinical methodology.** He classified diseases based on affected anatomy, etiology, and clinical features—a method that echoes modern diagnostic taxonomy. He also emphasized **the physician's role in ethical patient care**, advocating for careful observation, individualized treatment, and an understanding of both physical and environmental factors in disease causation.

The enduring value of *Tadhkirat al-Kahhalin* is underscored by its **translation into Latin and Greek** during the medieval period, where it became a **standard ophthalmological text in European medical schools**. It influenced physicians in both the Islamic East and Latin West and remained a foundational reference well into the early modern period (Abudawood et al., 2021; Henry & Jaffe, 2020). As such, Ali ibn Isa served as a vital **bridge between classical Greco-Roman medicine (notably Galen and Hippocrates)** and Renaissance ophthalmology, enriching both with his clinical clarity and practical wisdom.

In sum, Ali ibn Isa al-Kahhal's work embodies the **fusion of empirical observation, surgical innovation, and ethical medical practice**. His contributions not only preserved and advanced Greco-Arabic ophthalmology but also laid the **clinical foundations for modern eye care,** affirming his place among the greatest medical minds of the pre-modern world.

Strengths of Ali ibn Isa's Work

1. Clinical Approach – Unlike Ibn al-Haytham, Ali ibn Isa focused on medical applications of optics, particularly in diagnosing and treating eye diseases.
2. Detailed Ocular Anatomy – His descriptions of the eye's structure, such as the cornea, lens, and retina, were highly advanced for his time.
3. Surgical Techniques – He documented cataract extraction techniques, influencing later surgical practices in the Islamic world and Europe (Henry & Jaffe, 2020).

Limitations of His Work

- Lack of Experimental Approach – His work was largely descriptive rather than investigative, relying on prior knowledge rather than empirical testing.
- Limited Optical Theory – While he understood vision from a medical perspective, he did not delve deeply into the physics of light and vision.

Ibn al-Haytham: Empirical Foundations of Optics

Ibn al-Haytham (c. 965–1040) is regarded as the father of modern optics. His seminal work, *Kitab al-Manazir* (*The Book of Optics*), transformed the understanding of light and vision by applying the scientific method (Masoud & Masoud, 2006; Wilk, 2015). He rejected the Greek emission theory of vision (which suggested that the eye emits rays). Instead, he proposed the intromission theory, asserting that vision occurs when light rays enter the eye (Raynaud, 2022).

Strengths of Ibn al-Haytham's Work

1. Experimental Methodology – Unlike Ali ibn Isa, Ibn al-Haytham conducted systematic experiments on light refraction, reflection, and vision (Sabra, 2024).
2. Mathematical Analysis – He applied geometry and physics to explain optical phenomena, making his work more precise than purely descriptive accounts.
3. Camera Obscura and Perception Studies – His study of the pinhole camera (camera obscura) and psychological aspects of vision laid the groundwork for modern optics and visual perception research (Wilk, 2015).

Innovative Contributions of Ibn al-Haytham, with a Focus on the Camera Obscura

Ibn al-Haytham, also known as Alhazen, was one of the most influential figures in the history of optics. Among his many contributions, his pioneering work on the camera obscura stands out as one of the earliest empirical demonstrations of image formation through pinhole projection (Masoud & Masoud, 2006; Wilk, 2015; Sabra, 2024).

1. The Camera Obscura: A Revolutionary Optical Experiment

- Experimental Validation of Image Formation – He demonstrated that light travels in straight lines and that when it passes through a small aperture into a dark room, it projects an inverted image of the external scene onto the opposite wall.
- Quantitative Analysis of Light Rays – He used geometric optics to explain why the image was inverted and how the clarity of the image depended on the size of the aperture.
- Application to Vision Theory – His observations helped refine the intromission theory of vision, countering earlier Greek theories by Euclid and Ptolemy (Raynaud, 2022).

2. Beyond the Camera Obscura: Broader Optical Innovations

- **Empirical Method and Scientific Methodology** – Ibn al-Haytham emphasized observation, experimentation, and mathematical validation, setting the stage for the scientific method (Wilk, 2015).
- **Rejection of the Emission Theory of Vision** – He argued convincingly that light reflects off objects and enters the eye, a core principle of modern optics.
- **Studies on Reflection and Refraction** – His precise experimentation with light behavior through mirrors, water, and glass influenced later scholars like Bacon and Kepler (Sabra, 2024).
- **Analysis of Optical Illusions and Perception** – He acknowledged that perception involved cognitive processing, linking optics with early concepts in psychology (Raynaud, 2022).

Limitations of His Work

- Limited Medical Application – His contributions were primarily theoretical.
- Overemphasis on Theoretical Models – Some lacked immediate practical application in medical fields.

Comparative Analysis: Overlap and Divergence

The key distinction between Ali ibn Isa and Ibn al-Haytham lies in their approaches. Ali ibn Isa was a practitioner of ophthalmic medicine, while Ibn al-Haytham was a scientist revolutionizing vision theory through experimental optics (Masoud & Masoud, 2006; Abudawood et al., 2021).

Despite these differences, there was overlap:

- Both contributed to ocular anatomy and visual understanding.
- Their combined legacies were synthesized by later scholars such as Al-Farisi and Roger Bacon.

Legacy and Influence

Ali ibn Isa's *Tadhkirat al-Kahhalin* was translated into Latin and influenced medieval and Renaissance ophthalmology (Abudawood et al., 2021; Henry & Jaffe, 2020).

Ibn al-Haytham's *Kitab al-Manazir* deeply influenced European scientists like Kepler, Bacon, and Descartes, shaping the Scientific Revolution (Wilk, 2015; Sabra, 2024).

Conclusion

Ibn al-Haytham and Ali ibn Isa al-Kahhal, though operating in distinct intellectual domains—one in the realm of experimental physics and theoretical optics, the other in clinical ophthalmology—represent two towering pillars in the scientific edifice of the Islamic Golden Age. Their contributions, when viewed comparatively, illustrate not merely individual genius but the profound synergy between empirical science and medical practice (Masoud & Masoud, 2006; Abudawood et al., 2021).

Ibn al-Haytham's groundbreaking work, particularly his *Kitab al-Manazir*, transformed ancient optical speculation into a structured scientific discipline. By formulating the intromission theory of vision, rejecting the Greek emission model, and employing mathematics and controlled experimentation, he laid the methodological groundwork for the modern scientific method (Raynaud, 2022). His studies on refraction, reflection, and visual perception—including the ingenious demonstration of the camera obscura—not only anticipated the physics of Kepler and Newton but also foreshadowed key developments in neuroscience and cognitive psychology (Sabra, 2024; Wilk, 2015). His insistence on observation, hypothesis, and verification marks a decisive moment in the evolution of scientific rationality and evidential thinking.

Conversely, Ali ibn Isa al-Kahhal, through his masterwork *Tadhkirat al-Kahhalin*, provided a systematic, diagnostic, and therapeutic framework for ophthalmology that endured for centuries. He integrated traditional Greco-Arabic medical knowledge with his clinical expertise, presenting over 130 eye conditions with remarkable anatomical precision and practical treatment protocols (Library of Congress, 2021). His careful instructions on cataract surgery, corneal disease, and ocular trauma standardized eye care not only in the Islamic world but also influenced medical curricula in Europe after the translation of his works into Latin and Greek (Henry & Jaffe, 2020). In doing so, he laid the foundational clinical structure upon which modern ophthalmology was built.

Together, their legacies exemplify the dual engines of scientific advancement: theoretical innovation and practical application. Ibn al-Haytham's optical theories and experimental models provided a physics-based explanation of vision, while Ali ibn Isa's clinical work ensured that this understanding was translated into medical action. The dialogue between their fields—optics and ophthalmology—was not only complementary but also catalytic, as later figures like Roger Bacon, Al-Farisi, and Kepler fused these insights to further the integration of visual science and eye medicine.

More broadly, the intellectual influence of both scholars radiated far beyond their lifetimes. Ibn al-Haytham's methods directly impacted the epistemological shift of the European Renaissance, shaping the scientific temperament of early modern Europe. Ali ibn Isa's clinical acumen, preserved and disseminated through manuscript traditions, informed generations of physicians across cultural boundaries, from Baghdad to Bologna.

Their shared commitment to systematic reasoning, observational accuracy, and practical utility encapsulates the spirit of Islamic scientific inquiry—an inquiry that was not fragmented by specialization, but rather unified by the pursuit of truth through different lenses. In an age where the artificial divide between "theory" and "practice" still challenges academic disciplines, the works of Ibn al-Haytham and Ali ibn Isa remind us that true scientific progress thrives at their intersection.

In conclusion, the convergence of Ibn al-Haytham's empirical optics and Ali ibn Isa al-Kahhal's clinical ophthalmology forms a uniquely holistic tradition—one that continues to inform, inspire, and guide contemporary thought in both medical science and physical theory. Their enduring contributions are not just historical artifacts but living legacies, exemplifying how deeply rooted Islamic scholarship is in the intellectual architecture of modern science.

References

1. Masoud, M. T., & Masoud, F. (2006). *Ibn Al-Haytham: Father of Modern Optics*. Journal of Medical Biography. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6074172/
2. Abudawood, G. A., Alshareef, R., & Alghamdi, S. (2021). *Arab and Muslim Scientists and Their Contributions to the History of Ophthalmology*. Saudi Journal of Ophthalmology. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC8081083/
3. Library of Congress. (2021). *The Notebook of the Oculists* by Ali ibn Isa al-Kahhal. https://www.loc.gov/item/2021667380/
4. Henry, S. M., & Jaffe, A. M. (2020). *The History of Cataract Surgery: From Couching to Phacoemulsification*. Annals of Translational Medicine.

   https://atm.amegroups.com/article/view/54993/html
5. Raynaud, D. (2022). *Ibn al-Haytham's Ground Theory of Distance Perception*. i-Perception. https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/20416695221118388

6. Sabra, A. I. (2024). *A Light on Ibn al-Haytham's Optics, Books IV and V*. Annals of Science. https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/00033790.2024.2304737

7. Wilk, S. R. (2015). *Ibn al-Haytham: 1,000 Years after the Kitāb al-Manāẓir*. Optics and Photonics News.

   https://www.optica-opn.org/home/articles/volume_26/october_2015/features/ibn_al-haytham_1_000_years_after_the_kitab_al-man/

8. Masoud, M. T., & Masoud, F. (2006). *Ibn Al-Haytham: Father of Modern Optics*. Journal of Medical Biography, 14(3), 127–132. Link

9. Raynaud, D. (2022). *Ibn al-Haytham's Ground Theory of Distance Perception*. i-Perception, 13(4), 1–19. Link